AGENDA

COMMITTEE ON AUDIT

Meeting: 11:00 a.m., Tuesday, November 17, 2015

Glenn S. Dumke Auditorium

Lupe C. Garcia, Chair Douglas Faigin, Vice Chair

Adam Day Hugo N. Morales Peter J. Taylor

Consent Items

Approval of Minutes of Meeting of September 8, 2015

Discussion Items

1. Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments, Information

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF COMMITTEE ON AUDIT

Trustees of the California State University
Office of the Chancellor
Glenn S. Dumke Conference Center
401 Golden Shore
Long Beach, California

September 8, 2015

Members Present

Lupe C. Garcia, Chair Adam Day Hugo N. Morales Peter J. Taylor Lou Monville, Chair of the Board Timothy P. White, Chancellor

Chair Garcia called the meeting to order.

Approval of Minutes

The minutes of the meeting of July 21, 2015, were approved as submitted.

Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments

Mr. Larry Mandel, vice chancellor and chief audit officer, provided a status on the 2015 audit plan and follow-up on past audit assignments.

Mr. Mandel reported that a majority of the 2015 audit assignments are currently in process. He added that the remaining two subjects, Cloud Computing and Student Activities, will be initiated in the coming months. He reminded everyone that updates to the status report are displayed in green numerals and indicate progress toward or completion of recommendations since the distribution of the agenda. Mr. Mandel stated that the campuses and the CSU Chancellor's Office continue to do a good job completing recommendations on a timely basis. He further stated that audit management is working with the Stanislaus campus to clear the one remaining recommendation from the Sponsored Programs audit. Mr. Mandel also reported that both the reviews and associated recommendations pertaining to the construction projects are also being completed timely.

Chair Garcia asked for an explanation as to why some of the recommendations pertaining to auxiliary organizations are large in number for certain campuses.

Mr. Mandel explained that there are a lot of auxiliary organizations in the system. He indicated that at CSU Sacramento, there are five auxiliary organizations with 41 recommendations, but on average, there are only eight recommendations. He stated that the sixth round of auxiliary audits

2 Aud

is currently in process and added that over the years since these auxiliary audits started, the number of recommendations has decreased substantially.

The meeting adjourned.

Information Item
Agenda Item 1
November 17-18, 2015
Page 1 of 6

COMMITTEE ON AUDIT

Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments

Presentation By

Larry Mandel
Vice Chancellor and Chief Audit Officer
Office of Audit and Advisory Services

Summary

This item includes both a status report on the 2015 audit plan and follow-up on past assignments. For the 2015 year, assignments were made to conduct reviews of Auxiliary Organizations, high-risk areas (Information Security, Clery Act, Information Technology (IT) Procurement, Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards, Admissions, Cloud Computing, Scholarships, and Student Activities), a high profile area (College Reviews), and Construction. In addition, follow-up on current/past assignments (Auxiliary Organizations, Accessible Technology, Executive Travel, Sponsored Programs, Continuing Education, Information Security, IT Procurement, College Reviews, Clery Act, and Admissions) was being conducted on approximately 38 prior campus/auxiliary reviews. Attachment A summarizes the reviews in tabular form. An up-to-date Attachment A will be distributed at the committee meeting.

Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments

Auxiliary Organizations

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 267 staff weeks of activity (25.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to auditing internal compliance/internal control at eight campuses/31 auxiliaries. Three campus/eleven auxiliary reports have been completed, two campus/nine auxiliary reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, report writing is being completed for two campus/six auxiliaries, and fieldwork is being conducted at one campus/three auxiliaries.

High-Risk Areas

Information Security

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 37 staff weeks of activity (3.7 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of the systems and managerial/technical measures for

Aud Agenda Item 1 November 17-18, 2015 Page 2 of 6

ongoing evaluation of data/information collected; identifying confidential, private or sensitive information; authorizing access; securing information; detecting security breaches; and security incident reporting and response. Five campuses will be reviewed. Two campus reports have been completed, report writing is being completed for two campuses, and fieldwork is being conducted at one campus.

Clery Act

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus Clery Act policies and procedures to ensure compliance with CSU and federal requirements; review and testing of processes to compile required disclosures and statistics for the Annual Security Report (ASR); verification of the availability of educational programs for security awareness, and the prevention and reporting of crime; review and testing of ASR dissemination to required parties; review of campus good-faith efforts to comply with changes to the Clery Act imposed by the Violence Against Women Reauthorization Act (VAWA) for the 2014 ASR and progress in meeting the changes by the July 2015 deadline; and review of content and delivery of training. Six campuses will be reviewed. Six campus reports have been completed.

<u>Information Technology Procurement</u>

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 34 staff weeks of activity (3.3 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of policies and practices related to information technology procurement. Specific goals will include determining whether administration and management of information technology procurement activities provide an effective internal control environment, adequate local policies and operational procedures, current written delegations, and observance of good business practices in compliance with CSU policy. Five campuses were initially scheduled to be reviewed; due to additional information technology staff resources, six campuses will be visited. Four campus reports have been completed, report writing is being completed for one campus, and fieldwork is being conducted at one campus.

Payment Card Industry Data Security Standards

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 14 staff weeks of activity (1.4 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and auxiliary compliance with regulations specific to Payment Card Industry (PCI) Data Security Standards related to the security and protection of credit cards systems and data. The review would specifically include compliance with the new PCI 3.0 standard. Two campuses will be reviewed. One campus report is awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and report writing is being completed for one campus.

Aud Agenda Item 1 November 17-18, 2015 Page 3 of 6

<u>Admissions</u>

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of the evaluation of student records, including residency determination; processing admission applications, including use of supplemental admission criteria for impacted majors or campuses, transfer students, and redirection of eligible applicants; security of applicant data; application fee processing and granting of fee waivers; and compliance with state legislation and CSU requirements. Six campuses will be reviewed. Two campus reports have been completed, and four campus reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization.

Cloud Computing

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 11 staff weeks of activity (1.1 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and/or auxiliary activities pertaining to cloud computing, including review of policies and procedures to ensure compliance with CSU and other agency requirements; review of campus administration and oversight including but not limited to service availability, data ownership and backup and recovery, establishing contractual relationships with third-party service providers, and if sensitive data is maintained by a third party, review of involvement of campus information security personnel in the decision process; documentation of campus expectations for handling and securing the data; contract language covering security expectations; and monitoring third-party performance. Resource restrictions will not allow for an audit of Cloud Computing during 2015; it will be reviewed as part of the 2016 audit plan.

Scholarships

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 43 staff weeks of activity (4.2 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of campus and/or auxiliary activities pertaining to scholarships, including establishing student eligibility, awarding, and recordkeeping and protection of sensitive information; coordination between the financial aid department and awarding departments; and review of disbursement procedures for awarded scholarships. Six campuses will be reviewed. Report writing is being completed at four campuses, and two campus reports are awaiting a campus response prior to finalization.

Student Activities

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 50 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of activities relating to social and co-curricular programs, recreational sports, student clubs and organizations; review of policies and procedures to ensure

Aud Agenda Item 1 November 17-18, 2015 Page 4 of 6

compliance with CSU and other agency requirements; review of campus administration and oversight of student activities; review and appropriate testing for compliance with charters, bylaws and/or other governing documents for selected student organizations, clubs and other programs; review and testing to ensure appropriate staffing of student programs by qualified individuals and volunteers, including student leaders; and assessment to determine that required policies regarding non-discrimination, alcohol and drugs, and hazing are monitored and enforced. Six campuses will be reviewed. Fieldwork is being conducted at three campuses.

High Profile Area

College Reviews

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 49 staff weeks of activity (4.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of college/department administrative and financial controls, such as handling of cash and cash equivalents, expenditure processing, contracting activities, acquisition and tagging of sensitive equipment, and use of trust funds; and review of faculty assigned time, release time and special payments. Six campuses were initially scheduled to be reviewed; due to resource constraints, only five were visited. Five campus reports have been completed.

Construction

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 47 staff weeks of activity (4.6 percent of the plan) would be devoted to a review of design budgets and costs; the bid process; invoice processing and change orders; project management, architectural, and engineering services; contractor compliance; cost verification of major equipment and construction components; the closeout process and liquidated damages; and overall project accounting and reporting. Six projects will be reviewed. Three campus reports have been completed, one campus report is awaiting a campus response prior to finalization, and report writing is being completed for one project.

Advisory Services

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 216 staff weeks of activity (20.8 percent of the plan) would be devoted to partnering with management to identify solutions for business issues, offering opportunities to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of operating areas, and assisting with special requests, while ensuring the consideration of related internal control issues. Reviews are ongoing.

Aud Agenda Item 1 November 17-18, 2015 Page 5 of 6

Technology Support

The initial audit plan indicated that approximately 14 staff weeks of activity (1.3 percent of the plan) would be devoted to technology support for non-information technology specific audits and advisory services reviews. The provision of support is ongoing.

Investigations

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is periodically called upon to provide investigative reviews, which are often the result of alleged defalcations or conflicts of interest. In addition, whistleblower investigations are being performed on an ongoing basis, both by referral from the State Auditor and directly from the CSU Chancellor's Office. Forty-three staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 4.2 percent of the audit plan.

Committees/Special Projects

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is periodically called upon to provide consultation to the campuses and/or to participate on committees such as those related to information systems implementation and policy development, and to perform special projects. Special projects for 2015 will include the implementation of automated working papers in the Office of Audit and Advisory Services. Forty staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 3.8 percent of the audit plan.

Follow-ups

The audit plan indicated that approximately 15 staff weeks of activity (1.5 percent of the plan) would be devoted to follow-up on prior audit recommendations. The Office of Audit and Advisory Services is currently tracking approximately 38 current/past assignments (Auxiliary Organizations, Accessible Technology, Executive Travel, Sponsored Programs, Continuing Education, Information Security, IT Procurement, College Reviews, Clery Act, and Admissions) to determine the appropriateness of the corrective action taken for each recommendation and whether additional action is required.

Annual Risk Assessment

The Office of Audit and Advisory Services annually conducts a risk assessment to determine the areas of highest risk to the system. Eight staff weeks have been set aside for this purpose, representing approximately 0.8 percent of the audit plan.

Aud Agenda Item 1 November 17-18, 2015 Page 6 of 6

Administration

Day-to-day administration of the Office of Audit and Advisory Services represents approximately 4.3 percent of the audit plan.

Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments (as of 10/26/2015)

				2	2015 ASSIGN	GNMENTS	S					FOLLOV	FOLLOW-UP PAST/CURRENT ASSIGNMENTS	T/CURRE	INT ASSIG	SNMENTS	
	Aux	Info	Clery	College	⊢		 I	Cloud		Student		Auxiliary		Acce	Accessible	Executive	utive
	Orgs	Security	Act	Reviews	Procure	PC	Adm	Comptg	Scholar	Activity	J	Organizations	suc	Techr	Technology	Travel	vel
											•No.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.
BAK						AI			RW		4	35/35	•				
CHI	FW			AC							3						
Ö							AI				3	32/32	-			9/9	1
DH	RW								AI		3			9/9	•		
EB			AC		FW						3	31/31	•				
FRE		AC					AI				9	36/36	-				
FUL	AI				AC					FW	4						
MUH			AC								4	30/30	-				
LB	AC					RW	AC				4	9/18	3			3/3	1
LA			AC	AC					RW		4	18/18	-	2/2	-		
MA			AC								2	5/13	9				
MB							AI				2	23/23	-				
NOR	AI			AC					RW		5						
POM				AC	RW						2	11/11	-	7/7	•	4/4	1
SAC				AC						FW	2	41/41					
SB	AC				AC		AC				4	22/23	9				
SD		ΡW	AC								4	21/21		7/7	ı	9/9	
SF	AC	RW									3	4/17	5	1/1			
SJ		AC					A		RW		2	26/26				6/6	,
SLO			AC						A		3	11/11					
SM										FW	4	22/22	ı	4/4	ı		
SON	RW				AC						3						
STA		RW									4	14/14	•				
00					AC						2	5/5				0/3	9
SYS				AC										0/1	9	0/4	4
FW = H RW = H AI = A	FW = Field Work In P. RW = Report Writing i AI = Audit Incomplet conference and AC = Audit Complete	FW = Field Work In Progress RW = Report Writing in Progress AI = Audit Incomplete (awaiting formal exit conference and/or campus response) AC = Audit Complete	ss gress raiting forn impus resp		* The number ** The numbe • The numbe	nber of recomber of months of months of any	ommenda onths reco kiliary orga	 * The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommendations in the original report. ** The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed. • The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed.	actorily add nns have bu eviewed.	dressed foll een outstar	lowed by nding.	the number	er of recom	mendation	s in the orig	jinal report.	

* The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommendations in the original report.
** The number of months recommendations have been outstanding.
The number of auxiliary organizations reviewed.

Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Internal Audit Assignments (as of 10/26/2015)

Sponsored Continuing Information						 	JLLOW-UP	PAST/CU	RENT AS	FOLLOW-UP PAST/CURRENT ASSIGNMENTS	ည				
Programs Education Security (secs) Procurement (secs) Recise (secs) **Mo. *Recise (secs) **Mo. *Recise (secs) **Mo. **Recise (secs) **Mo. **Recise (secs) **Mo. **Procurement (secs) **Procurement (secs)		Spons	berc	Conti	nuing	Inforn	nation	_		Coll	ege	ਠੱ	ery		
Neccs **Mo. **Recs **Recs **Mo. **Recs		Progre	sms	Educ	ation	Sec	urity	Procur	ement	Revi	ews	⋖	ಕ	Admis	sions
666 10/10 9 0/5 4 0 1/1 11/21 9 0/5 4 0 0 1/1 11/21 9 0 0 0 0 0 1/1 0/1 4 0 <		*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.	*Recs	**Mo.
6/6 11/2 9 0/6 4 0 1/1 11/2 9 0/6 4 0 1/1 11/2 0 </td <td>BAK</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>10/10</td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	BAK					10/10	•								
1/1 . 0/1 4 0 <td>CHI</td> <td>9/9</td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>11/21</td> <td>6</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0/2</td> <td>4</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	CHI	9/9	-			11/21	6			0/2	4				
10,10 3,3 . 0,11 4 . 3,6 4 4 . 4 4 . 3,6 4 4 . 4 4 . . 6,7 .	ر ا	1/1	-												
10/10 3/3 - 0/11 4 0/0 - 3/6 4 4 10/10 - 2/2 - 4/4 - 0/0 - 0 <td>DH</td> <td></td>	DH														
10/10 2/2 0/11 4 0/0 0/3 3 10/10 2/2 4/4 0/0 0/3 3 1 1/6 7 0/4 4 0/3 3 1 6/7 7 0/4 4 0/3 4 1 6/7 7 0/4 4 0/3 4 3/3 6/7 7 0/4 4 0/3 4 8/8 6/5 0/3 0	EB			3/3	1							3/6	4		
10/10 - 2/2 - 4/4 - 0/0 - 0/3 3 1 1 1/6 7 0 0 0/4 4 0/3 3 1 1 1/6 7 0 0 4 0/3 3 1 1 1 1 0 0 0 4 0/3 4 1 1 1 0 <td>FRE</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0/11</td> <td>4</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	FRE					0/11	4								
777 - 4/4 - - 4/4 - 0/3 3 777 - 677 7 - 0/4 4 0/3 4 3/3 - 677 7 - 0/4 4 0/3 4 3/3 - 67 7 7 - 0/3 4 8/8 - 6 - - 0/3 2 4 8/8 - 6 - - 0/3 2 2 8/8 - 6 - - 0/3 2 2 3/3 - 1 0/1 - 0/3 5 0 0 3/3 - 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 4/4 - 1 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	FUL	10/10		2/2				0/0	-						
7 116 7 014 4 003 4 777 - 677 7 0 4 0.04 4 0.03 4 3/3 - 5/5 - 67 7 7 0 0 2 4 0 4 4 0 3 4 4 0	HOM					4/4	•					0/3	3		
777 - 6/7 7 0 4 0/4 4 0/3 4 3/3 - 6/7 7 0 0 0 0 4 0 0 4 0 4 0 <	ГВ					1/6	7							0/0	
777 - 677 7 0/3 2 3/3 - 5/5 - 6/7 7 9 0/3 2 8/8 - 5/5 - 6 0 0 2/4 5 0	ΓĄ									0/4	4	0/3	4		
3/3 - 5/5 - 4 5/4 5 - 6 - 8 - 8 - 8 - 8 - 8 - 8 - - 8 - 8 - 8 - - 1/3 5 - 8 - - 8 - - 8 - 8 - - 8 - - 8 - - - - - - - - - - -	MA	2/7				2/9	7					0/3	2		
8/8 - 5/5 - <td>MB</td> <td>3/3</td> <td></td>	MB	3/3													
3/3 - 1/3 5 1/3 5 4 1/3 5 4 4 5 4 5 4 5 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 7 6 6 7 6 6 7 6 7 6 7	NOR	8/8		5/2						2/4	5				
4/4 - 10/10 - 0/2 2 0/8 5 - 0/4 - 4/4 - 1/17 2 - 0/2 2 0 - 0/4 3 -	POM	3/3								1/3	5				
4/4 - 10/10 - 0/2 2 0 0/4 3 4/4 - 5/6 6 - 1/17 2 - 0/4 3 7/7 - 5/6 6 - 1/17 2 - 0/3 4 0/0 - 1/3 9 - 0/0 - 0/3 4 - 2/5 7 1/3 9 - 0/1 2 - 0/1 2 - 0/1 - 0/1 - 0/1 - 0/3 4 - 0/3 - 0/3 - 0/3 - 0/3 - 0/3 0/3 - 0/3 - 0/3	SAC									8/0	5				
4/4 - 5/6 6 1/17 2 0 0/4 7/7 - - 1/17 2 0 0 0/3 0/0 - 1/3 9 0	SB			2//2		10/10		0/2	2					0/2	2
4/4 - 5/6 6 1/17 2 6 6 7/7 2 6 6 7/3 7	SD											0/4	3		
7/7 - 1/17 2 - 0/3 0/0 - 1/3 9 0/0 - 0/0 - 0/0 - 0/0 - 0/1 0/1 - 0/1 <td>SF</td> <td>4/4</td> <td>'</td> <td>9/9</td> <td>9</td> <td></td>	SF	4/4	'	9/9	9										
7/7 - 0/0 - 0/0 - 0/0 - 0/1 - 0/1 - 0/1 - 0/1 - 0/1 -	SJ					1/17	2								
0/0 - 1/3 9 - 0/0 - </td <td>SLO</td> <td>2//</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>0/3</td> <td>4</td> <td></td> <td></td>	SLO	2//										0/3	4		
0/0 - 0/0 - - 0/0 - </td <td>SM</td> <td></td>	SM														
7/7 - 1/3 9 6 7 7 2/5 7 2/2 - 0/1 2 0/1	SON	0/0						0/0							
2/5 7 2/2 - 0/1 2	STA	2//		1/3	6										
2/5 7 2/2 - 0/1	00							0/1	2						
	SYS	2/5	7	2/2						0/1	2				

Status Report on Current and Follow-Up Construction Audit Assignments (as of 10/26/2015)

	Project	Project	Contractor	Construction	Start	Comp.	Managed	Current	Current Campus Follow-Up	ollow-Up	CPDC Follow-Up	Ilow-Up
	No.			Cost	Date			*	**RECS	***MO.	**RECS	***MO.
2015	BAK-230	Art Center and Satellite Plant	Rudolph and Sletten	\$14,290,932	5/27/2013	May-14	Campus	AC	1/1	•		
	POM-1039	Recreation Center	C W Driver	\$43,135,626	8/20/2012	Jan-15	Campus	AC	0/0	•		
	SD-623	Storm/Nasatir Halls Renovation	C W Driver	\$52,972,562	6/27/2012	Sep-14	Campus	AC	0/1	2		
	MA-235	Physical Education Replacement	Gilbane Building Co.	\$27,540,143	3/27/2013	Jan-15	CO	AI				
	BAK-816	Student Housing Northeast, Ph I	Bernards Brothers, Inc.	\$32,479,629	6/10/2013	Jan-15	Campus	RW				
	*FW = Field	*FW = Field Work in Progress; RW = Report Writing in Progress; AI = Audit Incomplete (awaiting formal exit conference and/or response); AC = Audit Complete	/riting in Progress; AI = Au	idit Incomplete (awaiting form	nal exit con	ference and	/or respor	1se); AC = ,	Audit Comp	olete	
_	**The numb	**The number of recommendations satisfactorily addressed followed by the number of recommedations in the original report.	ly addressed followed by the	he number of re-	commedation	is in the or	iginal report					
	***The num	***The number of months that recommendations have been outstanding	s have been outstanding.									
Ī												